

Mixing

Convergence in density

Natural density. The *upper* and the *lower density* of a set $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ are defined as

$$\bar{d}(J) := \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{|J \cap [0, n)|}{n},$$

$$\underline{d}(J) := \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{|J \cap [0, n)|}{n}.$$

If the upper and the lower density of J coincide, we call the common value the *density* of J and denote it by $d(J)$.

For instance,

$$d(\emptyset) = 0, \quad d(\mathbb{N}) = 1, \quad d(\{2k : k \in \mathbb{N}\}) = d(\{2k + 1 : k \in \mathbb{N}\}) = 1/2.$$

The following is an example of a set which does not have a well-defined density.

Example (A set without density). Each $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ can naturally be represented by its indicator sequence $x \in \{0, 1\}^{\mathbb{N}}$ where $x_i = 1$ if and only if $i \in J$. Conversely, every sequence $x \in \{0, 1\}^{\mathbb{N}}$ is the indicator sequence of one and only one set $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$.

Consider the set J whose indicator sequence has the following form:

$$x_i := \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } N_{2k} \leq i < N_{2k+1} \text{ for some } k \in \mathbb{N}, \\ 0 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

where $0 = N_0 < N_1 < N_2 < N_3 < \dots$ are such that $N_k/N_{k+1} \rightarrow 0$ as $k \rightarrow \infty$. (For instance, we can choose $N_k := 2^{k^2}$.) Then, it is easy to verify that $\underline{d}(J) = 0 \neq 1 = \bar{d}(J)$. $\circ$

We say that $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ has *full density* if $d(J) = 1$.

Remark. The natural density is somewhat like a probability measure on $\mathbb{N}$:

- (additivity) If $J_1 \cap J_2 = \emptyset$, then $d(J_1 \cup J_2) = d(J_1) + d(J_2)$ provided $d(J_1)$ and $d(J_2)$ exist.
- (monotonicity) If $J_1 \subseteq J_2$, then $d(J_1) \leq d(J_2)$ provided $d(J_1)$ and $d(J_2)$ exist.
- (sub-additivity) $d(J_1 \cup J_2) \leq d(J_1) + d(J_2)$ provided all three densities exist.

However, it is not countably additive, and lacks continuity:

- If $J_n := \{n\}$, then $d(\bigcup_{n=0}^{\infty} J_n) = 1 \neq 0 = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} d(J_n)$.
- If $J_n := \{n, n+1, n+2, \dots\}$, then $d(\bigcap_{n=0}^{\infty} J_n) = 0 \neq 1 = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} d(J_n)$. $\diamond$

Full-density diagonal trick. Recall the *diagonal* trick often used in analysis: if

$$(a_n^{(0)})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}, (a_n^{(1)})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}, (a_n^{(2)})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}, \dots$$

is a sequence of sequences, each being a subsequence of the previous one, then there exists a sequence (the “diagonal” sequence) which is eventually a subsequence of each $(a_n^{(k)})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$.

Clearly the diagonal trick is about the indices rather than the values of the sequences. The following is a concise formulation of the trick:

Lemma (Diagonal sequence). *Let $\mathbb{N} = J_0 \supseteq J_1 \supseteq J_2 \supseteq \dots$ be a sequence of infinite sets. There exists an infinite set $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ (the “diagonal” set) such that $J \setminus J_k$ is finite for each $k \in \mathbb{N}$.*

Here, we should think of J_k as the set of indices of the k -th subsequence of $(a_n^{(0)})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$.

It turns out that if all the sets J_k have full density, then the diagonal set can also be chosen to have full density.

Lemma (Full-density diagonal sequence). *Let $\mathbb{N} = J_0 \supseteq J_1 \supseteq J_2 \supseteq \dots$ be a sequence of sets such that $d(J_k) = 1$ for each $k \in \mathbb{N}$. There exists a set $J \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ (the “diagonal” set) such that (i) $J \setminus J_k$ is finite for each $k \in \mathbb{N}$, and (ii) $d(J) = 1$.*

Proof. Pick $0 = N_0 < N_1 < N_2 < N_3 < \dots$ such that for each k , we have

$$\frac{|J_k \cap [0, n)|}{n} > 1 - 2^{-k} \quad \text{for all } n \geq N_k.$$

Set

$$J := \bigcup_{k=0}^{\infty} (J_k \cap [N_k, N_{k+1})) .$$

Then,

- (i) For each k , we have $J \setminus J_k \subseteq [0, N_k)$ because $J_k \supseteq J_{k+1} \supseteq \dots$. Hence, $J \setminus J_k$ is finite.
- (ii) Note that if $n < N_{k+1}$, then $J \cap [0, n) \supseteq J_k \cap [0, n)$ because $J_k \subseteq J_{k-1} \subseteq \dots \subseteq J_0$. For each n , let k_n denote the unique value such that $N_{k_n} \leq n < N_{k_n+1}$. Then,

$$\frac{|J \cap [0, n)|}{n} \geq \frac{|J_{k_n} \cap [0, n)|}{n} > 1 - 2^{-k_n} .$$

Since $k_n \rightarrow \infty$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$, we find that

$$\underline{d}(J) = \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{|J \cap [0, n)|}{n} \geq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} (1 - 2^{-k_n}) = 1 .$$

Therefore, $d(J) = 1$. □